

1 Mark W. Bucher
2 mark@calpolicycenter.org
3 CA S.B.N. # 210474
4 Law Office of Mark W. Bucher
5 18002 Irvine Blvd., Suite 108
6 Tustin, CA 92780-3321
7 Phone: 714-313-3706
8 Fax: 714-573-2297

7 Brian K. Kelsey (*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*)
8 bkelsey@libertyjusticecenter.org
9 Jeffrey M. Schwab (*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*)
10 jschwab@libertyjusticecenter.org
11 Senior Attorneys
12 Liberty Justice Center
13 190 South LaSalle Street
14 Suite 1500
15 Chicago, Illinois 60603
16 Phone: 312-263-7668
17 Fax: 312-263-7702

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*
16 *Additional Counsel on Following Page*

17 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
18 **FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
19

20 Thomas Few,
21 Plaintiff

22 v.

23 United Teachers of Los Angeles; Austin
24 Beutner, in his official capacity as
25 Superintendent of Los Angeles Unified
26 School District; Xavier Becerra, in his
27 official capacity as Attorney General of
28 California,
Defendants.

Case No. 2:18-cv-09531-JLS (DFMx)

**JOINT STATEMENT OF
UNDISPUTED FACTS**

1 SCOTT A. KRONLAND (SBN 171693)
2 skronland@altshulerberzon.com
3 DANIELLE LEONARD (SBN 218201)
4 dleonard@altshulerberzon.com
5 P. CASEY PITTS (SBN 262463)
6 cpitts@altshulerberzon.com
7 ALTSHULER BERZON LLP
8 177 Post Street, Suite 300
9 San Francisco, CA 94108
10 Telephone: 415-421-7151
11 Facsimile: 415-362-8064

9 IRA L. GOTTLIEB (SBN 103236)
10 igottlieb@bushgottlieb.com
11 BUSH GOTTLIEB, A Law Corporation
12 801 North Brand Boulevard, Suite 950
13 Glendale, California 91203-1260
14 Telephone: (818) 973-3200
15 Facsimile: (818) 973-3201

14 *Attorneys for Defendant UTLA*

16 Plaintiff Thomas Few and Defendants United Teachers Los Angeles (“UTLA”) by
17 and through their undersigned counsel of record, stipulate that, solely for purposes of
18 filing cross-motions for summary judgment in this case, the following facts are true.
19 Entering this stipulation does not preclude any party from submitting evidence
20 establishing or refuting any other fact in support of or opposition to a motion for summary
21 judgment.

22 1. Thomas Few has been a special education teacher employed by the Los
23 Angeles Unified School District (“LAUSD”) since August 2016.

24 2. A true and correct copy of Few’s September 8, 2016 UTLA membership
25 application, which Few signed, is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

26 3. A true and correct copy of Few’s February 13, 2018 updated UTLA
27 membership application, which Few signed, is attached hereto as Exhibit B.

1 4. A true and correct copy of Few's June 2018 letter received by UTLA is
2 attached hereto as Exhibit C.

3 5. A true and correct copy of UTLA's July 13, 2018 letter to Few, which Few
4 received, is attached hereto as Exhibit D.

5 6. On August 3, 2018, Few submitted another letter to both UTLA and LAUSD,
6 which UTLA and LAUSD received. A true and correct copy of Few's August 3, 2018 letter
7 is attached hereto as Exhibit E.

8 7. On or about October 10, 2018, Few submitted a letter to UTLA, which UTLA
9 received. A true and correct copy of Few's October 10, 2018 letter is attached hereto as
10 Exhibit F.

11 8. On October 19, 2018, UTLA sent a letter to Few, which Few received. A true
12 and correct copy of UTLA's October 19, 2018 letter is attached hereto as Exhibit G.

13 9. On or about November 21, 2018, UTLA sent Few a letter dated November 20,
14 2018, which Few received. A true and correct copy of UTLA's November 20, 2018 letter
15 is attached hereto as Exhibit H. UTLA included with the letter a check for \$433.31 payable
16 to Few.

17 10. The check for \$433.31 reimbursed Few for all dues deducted from his pay from
18 the beginning of June 2018 to October 31, 2018 (corresponding to the November 5, 2018
19 pay date), including interest.

20 11. LAUSD has not deducted any dues from Few's wages since October 31, 2018
21 (corresponding to the November 5, 2018 pay date).

22 12. On or about December 5, 2018, Few's counsel responded to UTLA with a
23 letter acknowledging Few's receipt and deposit of the check provided by UTLA. A true
24 and correct copy of the December 5, 2018 letter is attached hereto as Exhibit I.

25 13. From the time he began his employment through October 31, 2018, LAUSD
26 deducted union dues of approximately eighty-six dollars (\$86) per month from Few's
27 paychecks and remitted them to UTLA.

1 14. Prior to the U.S. Supreme Court's decision in *Janus v. AFSCME, Council 31*
2 on June 27, 2018, bargaining unit workers who were not UTLA members were required to
3 pay fair-share fees to UTLA, pursuant to the Educational Employment Relations Act.
4 LAUSD deducted fair-share fees from wages. Compulsory fair-share fees were less than
5 membership dues. LAUSD stopped deducting, and UTLA stopped receiving, fair-share
6 fees after *Janus*.

7
8 Dated: October 17, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

9 /s/ Brian K. Kelsey

10 Brian K. Kelsey (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)
11 bkelsey@libertyjusticecenter.org
12 Jeffrey M. Schwab (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)
13 jschwab@libertyjusticecenter.org

14 Senior Attorneys
15 Liberty Justice Center
16 190 South LaSalle Street
17 Suite 1500
18 Chicago, Illinois 60603
19 Phone: 312-263-7668
20 Fax: 312-263-7702

21 Mark W. Bucher
22 mark@calpolicycenter.org
23 CA S.B.N. # 210474
24 Law Office of Mark W. Bucher
25 18002 Irvine Blvd., Suite 108
26 Tustin, CA 92780-3321
27 Phone: 714-313-3706
28 Fax: 714-573-2297

Attorneys for Plaintiff

/s/ P. Casey Pitts

SCOTT A. KRONLAND (SBN 171693)
skronland@altshulerberzon.com
DANIELLE LEONARD (SBN 218201)
dleonard@altshulerberzon.com

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

P. CASEY PITTS (SBN 262463)
cpitts@altshulerberzon.com
ALTSHULER BERZON LLP
177 Post Street, Suite 300
San Francisco, CA 94108
Telephone: 415-421-7151
Facsimile: 415-362-8064

IRA L. GOTTLIEB (SBN 103236)
igottlieb@bushgottlieb.com
BUSH GOTTLIEB, A Law Corporation
801 North Brand Boulevard, Suite 950
Glendale, California 91203-1260
Telephone: (818) 973-3200
Facsimile: (818) 973-3201

Attorneys for Defendant UTLA

SIGNATURE ATTESTATION

Pursuant to Local Rule 5-4.3.4(a)(2), I hereby certify that authorization for the filing of this document has been obtained from each of the other signatories shown above and that all signatories have authorized placement of their electronic signature on this document.

Dated: October 17, 2019

/s/ Brian K. Kelsey
Brian K. Kelsey
Liberty Justice Center
Attorney for Plaintiff